APS-DFD 2005

On a dynamical model for the origin of non-Gaussian statistics in turbulence

Yi Li & Charles Meneveau

Thanks to Dr. Laurent Chevillard and Prof. Greg Eyink for many useful discussions

Work is supported by NSF (ASTRO-ITR + CTS) and ONR



Mechanical Engineering







Elongated tails in PDFs: (+ skewness in longitudinal direction)

 $\delta u(\ell) = u_L(\mathbf{x} + \ell \mathbf{e}_L) - u_L(\mathbf{x})$



Background A:

Small-scale intermittency



Observations:

- Non-Gaussian tails are very robust
- They occur in DNS, even at small Re turbulence
- They appear in ad-hoc turbulence models (not systematically derived from N-S):
 - Shell models of turbulence (see Biferale Annu. Rev. Fluid Mech. 2003)
 - Mapping closure (Kraichnan PRL 65, 1990; She & Orszag PRL 66, 1991)
- Simple mechanistic explanation "elusive" in 3D
- Do not occur in 2D turbulence (but see 1-D Burgers equation...)

Background B: u(x,t)Х **1-D Burgers equation:** Intense negative gradient occurs over smaller fraction of domain $\frac{\partial u}{\partial t} + u \frac{\partial u}{\partial x} = v \frac{\partial^2 u}{\partial x^2}$ 10^{+1} From: Kraichnan PRL 65. 1990 (mapping closure) $A = \frac{\partial u}{\partial x}$ PDF $\frac{\partial}{\partial x} \left(\frac{\partial u}{\partial t} + u \frac{\partial u}{\partial x} \right) = \frac{\partial A}{\partial t} + u \frac{\partial A}{\partial x} + AA$ NORMALIZED $\frac{dA}{dt} = -A^2$ $\delta u(\ell) \equiv A\ell$ Gaussian i.c. $\frac{d\delta u}{dt} = -\delta u^2 \ell^{-1}$ 10^{-3} -5 5 NORMALIZED AMPLITUDE

Here is a "trivial" picture of origin of non-Gaussian tails and skewness: free particle motion. What is the 3-D analogue of this? Problems: which direction? Multiple velocity components..

Background C:

Restricted Euler dynamics in (inertial range of) turbulence:

Restricted Euler:

Filtered turbulence:

Vieillefosse, Phys. A, **125**, 1985 Cantwell, Phys. Fluids A**4**, 1992 Borue & Orszag, JFM **366**, 1998 Van der Bos *et al.*, Phys Fluids **14**, 2002:

• Filtered Navier-Stokes equations:



Background C:

Restricted Euler dynamics $H_{ii} = 0$ in (inertial range of) turbulence:

• Invariants (Cantwell 1992):

$$Q_{\Delta} \equiv -\frac{1}{2}\tilde{A}_{ki}\tilde{A}_{ik}$$
$$R_{\Delta} \equiv -\frac{1}{3}\tilde{A}_{km}\tilde{A}_{mn}\tilde{A}_{nk}$$

$$\tilde{A}_{ji} \frac{d\tilde{A}_{ij}}{dt} = \tilde{A}_{ji} (\tilde{A}_{ik} \tilde{A}_{kj} - \frac{1}{3} \tilde{A}_{mk} \tilde{A}_{km} \delta_{ij}) \quad \rightarrow \quad \frac{d}{d\tilde{A}}$$

$$\tilde{A}_{jk}\tilde{A}_{ki}\frac{dA_{ij}}{dt} = \tilde{A}_{jk}\underbrace{\tilde{A}_{ki}(\tilde{A}_{ik}\tilde{A}_{kj})}_{\neq k} - \frac{1}{3}\tilde{A}_{mk}\tilde{A}_{km}\delta_{ij}) \rightarrow$$

Cayley-Hamilton Theorem $A_{ik}A_{kn}A_{nj} + PA_{ik}A_{kj} + QA_{ij} + R\delta_{ij} = 0$

Remarkable projection (decoupling)!

More literature:

Equations for all 5 invariants: Martin, Dopazo & Valiño (Phys. Fluids, 1998) Equations for eigenvalues, and higher-dimensional versions: Liu & Tadmor (Commun. Math. Phys., 2002)

Analytical solution:





From: Cantwell, Phys. Fluids 1992)

• Singularity in finite time, but

- Predicts preference for axisymmetric expansion
- Predicts alignment of vorticity with intermediate eigenvector of S: β_s

Background D:

Models for pressure-viscous-SGS Hessian:

- Stochastic differential equation (H_{ij} constructed such that $\tilde{A}_{ij}\tilde{A}_{ij}$ is lognormal with imposed variance, yields stationary system, Girimaji & Pope, Phys. Fluids A2, 1990)
- Model H_{ii} by keeping track of material deformations:

- Tetrad dynamics (Chertkov, Pumir & Shraiman, Phys. Fluids 11, 1999; Nasso et al..)

- Cauchy-Green tensor evolution (Jeong & Girimaji, Theor. Comp. Fluid Dyn. 16, 2003)

- At the cost of solving N > 8 ODEs (stochastic or deterministic), all these models predict intermittency and skewness (plus other things, such as vorticity alignment trends,...)
- But "large" N precludes "text-book simple" insight into formation of non-Gaussian tails...

We seek particular "projections" of Restricted Euler dynamics that could illuminate formation of non-Gaussian tails,

i.e. "are there any other simple ODE's like

$$\begin{cases} \frac{dQ_{\Delta}}{dt} = -3R_{\Delta} \\ \frac{dR_{\Delta}}{dt} = \frac{2}{3}Q_{\Delta}^{2} \end{cases}$$
??"

Velocity increments: Lagrangian evolution



$$\tilde{u}_i(\mathbf{x}+\mathbf{r}) - \tilde{u}_i(\mathbf{x}) = \tilde{A}_{ki}r_k + O(r^2)$$

Longitudinal

$$\delta u \equiv \tilde{A}_{ki} r_k \frac{r_i}{r} \frac{\ell}{r}$$
$$\delta u(t) \equiv \tilde{A}(t) : (\hat{\mathbf{r}}(t)\hat{\mathbf{r}}(t)) \ \ell = \tilde{A}_{rr} \ell$$

Transverse

$$\delta v^2 \equiv \left[\left(\delta_{ij} - \frac{r_i r_j}{r^2} \right) \tilde{A}_{kj} r_k \frac{\ell}{r} \right]^2$$

See: Yi & Meneveau, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95, 164502, Oct. 2005

Velocity increments: Lagrangian evolution

$$\delta u \equiv \tilde{A}_{ki} r_k \frac{r_i}{r} \frac{\ell}{r} \qquad \qquad \delta v^2 \equiv \left[\left(\delta_{ij} - \frac{r_i r_j}{r^2} \right) \tilde{A}_{kj} r_k \frac{\ell}{r} \right]^2$$

Rate of change of longitudinal velocity increment, following the flow (both end-points in linearized flow):

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{d}{dt}\left(\tilde{A}_{ki}r_{k}\frac{r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r}\right) = \frac{d\tilde{A}_{ki}}{dt}\frac{r_{k}r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} + \tilde{A}_{k}\frac{dr_{k}}{dt}\frac{r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} + \tilde{A}_{k}\frac{dr_{k}}{dt}\frac{r_{k}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} - 2\tilde{A}_{ki}\frac{r_{k}r_{i}}{r}\frac{dr}{dt}\ell$$

$$\frac{d\tilde{A}_{ij}}{dt} = -(\tilde{A}_{ik}\tilde{A}_{kj} - \frac{1}{3}\tilde{A}_{mk}\tilde{A}_{km}\delta_{ij}) + H_{ij}$$

$$\frac{d\tilde{A}_{ij}}{dt} = -(\tilde{A}_{ik}\tilde{A}_{kj} - \frac{1}{3}\tilde{A}_{pq}\tilde{A}_{qp}\delta_{k})\frac{r_{k}r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} + \tilde{A}_{ki}\tilde{A}_{mk}r_{m}\frac{r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} + \tilde{A}_{ki}\tilde{A}_{mi}r_{m}\frac{r_{k}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} - 2\tilde{A}_{ki}\frac{r_{k}r_{i}}{r}\frac{dr}{dt}\ell$$

$$\frac{dr_{i}}{dt} = \frac{\partial\tilde{u}_{i}}{\partial x_{m}}r_{m} = \tilde{A}_{mi}r_{m}$$

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = -(\tilde{A}_{km}\tilde{A}_{mi} - \frac{1}{3}\tilde{A}_{pq}\tilde{A}_{qp}\delta_{ki})\frac{r_{k}r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} + \tilde{A}_{ki}\tilde{A}_{mk}r_{m}\frac{r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} + \tilde{A}_{ki}\tilde{A}_{mi}r_{m}\frac{r_{k}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r} - 2\tilde{A}_{ki}\frac{r_{k}r_{i}}{r^{3}}\frac{r_{m}}{r}\ell\tilde{A}_{pm}r_{p} + H_{mn}\frac{r_{m}r_{n}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r}$$

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \left[\left(\delta_{ij} - \frac{r_{i}r_{j}}{r^{2}}\right)\tilde{A}_{kj}r_{k}\frac{\ell}{r}\right]^{2}\frac{1}{\ell} - \left(\tilde{A}_{ki}r_{k}\frac{r_{i}}{r}\frac{\ell}{r}\right)^{2}\frac{1}{\ell} + \frac{1}{3}\tilde{A}_{pq}\tilde{A}_{qp}\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_{m}r_{n}}{r^{2}}\ell$$

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell}\left(\delta v^{2} - \delta u^{2}\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q\ell\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_{m}r_{i}}{r^{2}}\ell$$

$$H_{mn} = \left(\frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial x_{m}\partial x_{k}}\left[p\delta_{kn} - \tau_{kn}^{SGS} + 2v\tilde{S}_{kn}\right]\right)^{anisotropic}$$

Velocity increments: Lagrangian evolution

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_m r_i}{r^2}\ell$$

From a similar derivation for δv :

$$H_{mn} = \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_m \partial x_k} \left[p\delta_{kn} - \tau_{kn}^{SGS} + 2\nu\tilde{S}_{kn}\right]\right)^{anisotropic}$$

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell}\delta u\delta v + H_{mn}r_m e_n,$$

$$e_n = \frac{\delta u_i \left(\delta_{in} - \frac{r_i r_n}{r^2}\right)}{\delta v}$$

Restricted Euler simplification: $H_{ij} = 0$

Velocity increments under Restricted Euler, at fixed displacement length (linear vel. field):

most basic trends towards intermittency not very sensitive to *Q*-coupling

Advected delta-vee equations:

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q_0\ell \\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -\frac{2}{\ell} \delta u \,\delta v \qquad \text{See: Yi \& M, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95,} \\ 164502, \text{ Oct. 2005} \end{cases}$$

Does this simple system have ANY resemblance to what happens in turbulence?

256³ DNS, filtered at 40η , evaluated Lagrangian rate of change of velocity increments numerically, and compared to RHS of advected delta-vee equations



Comparison with DNS, Lagrangian rate of change of velocity increments:



Evolution from Gaussian initial conditions, $Q_0 = 0$:

Initial condition:

 δu = Gaussian zero mean, unit variance

 δv_k = Gaussian zero mean, unit variance, k=1,2

$$\delta v = \sqrt{\delta v_1^2 + \delta v_2^2}$$

set
$$\ell=1$$
 and $Q_0=0$

Non-dimensional:

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \delta v^2 - \delta u^2\\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -2\delta u \ \delta v \end{cases}$$

Evolution from Gaussian initial conditions, $Q_0 = 0$:



Evolution from Gaussian initial conditions, $Q_0 = 0$:



Basic properties: Phase-space & invariant



 $U = \frac{1}{2}\delta u^2 / \delta v + \frac{1}{2}\delta v = \frac{1}{2}(\delta u^2 + \delta v^2)\frac{1}{\delta v}$

Alignment bias correction factor:

(thanks to Greg Eyink for pointing out the need for a correction)



Can be evaluated from advected delta-vee system



See: Yi & Meneveau, Phys. Rev. Lett. **95**, 164502,

Effects of neglected terms:

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_m r_i}{r^2}\ell\\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell}\delta u\delta v + H_{mn}\frac{r_m e_n}{r}\ell, \end{cases}$$

$$H_{mn} = \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_m \partial x_k} \left[p\delta_{kn} - \tau_{kn}^{SGS} + 2\nu \tilde{S}_{kn}\right]\right)^{anisotropic}$$

Effects of *Q***-term: continuity**

$$Q = -\frac{1}{2}\tilde{A}_{ij}\tilde{A}_{ji}$$

$$Q = -\frac{1}{2} \left(\tilde{A}_{rr} \tilde{A}_{rr} + \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} + \left(-\tilde{A}_{rr} - \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} \right)^{2} + ... \right)$$

$$Q = -\frac{1}{2} \left(2 \tilde{A}_{rr} \tilde{A}_{rr} + \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} + ... \right)$$

$$\rightarrow -\frac{2}{3} Q = +\frac{2}{3} \delta u^{2} \frac{1}{\ell^{2}} - \frac{2}{3} Q^{*}$$

$$Q^{*} = 0, \qquad \begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt} \delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^{2} - \frac{1}{3} \delta u^{2} \right) \\ \frac{d}{dt} \delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell} \delta u \delta v \end{cases}$$



Effects of neglected terms:

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_m r_i}{r^2}\ell\\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell}\delta u\delta v + H_{mn}\frac{r_m e_n}{r}\ell, \end{cases}$$

Effects of Q-term: continuity

$$Q = -\frac{1}{2} \left(\tilde{A}_{rr} \tilde{A}_{rr} + \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} + \left(-\tilde{A}_{rr} - \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} \right)^{2} + \dots \right)$$

$$Q = -\frac{1}{2} \left(2 \tilde{A}_{rr} \tilde{A}_{rr} + \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} \tilde{A}_{\theta\theta} + \dots \right)$$

$$\rightarrow -\frac{2}{3} Q = +\frac{2}{3} \delta u^{2} \frac{1}{\ell^{2}} - \frac{2}{3} Q^{*}$$

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt} \delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^{2} - \frac{1}{3} \delta u^{2} \right) \\ \frac{d}{dt} \delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell} \delta u \delta v \end{cases}$$



Effects of dimensionality on *Q***-term:**

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_m r_i}{r^2}\ell \\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell}\delta u\delta v + H_{mn}\frac{r_m e_n}{r}\ell, \end{cases}$$

$$H_{mn} = \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_m \partial x_k} \left[p\delta_{kn} - \tau_{kn}^{SGS} + 2\nu \tilde{S}_{kn}\right]\right)^{anisotropic}$$

D=2:

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2 \right) - \det(\tilde{\mathbf{A}})\ell + \dots$$

$$\det(\tilde{\mathbf{A}}) = \tilde{A}_{rr}(-\tilde{A}_{rr}) + \dots$$
$$-\det(\tilde{\mathbf{A}})\ell \to +\delta u^2 \frac{1}{\ell}$$

Cancels the self-amplification of negative δu

Restricted Euler in 2D: no self-stretching of gradient (i.e. Gaussian I.C. remains Gaussian...)

$$\frac{dA_{ij}}{dt} = 0$$



Very strong directional coupling due to pressure No intermittency in δ -velocities



Effects of dimensionality on *Q***-term:**

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_m r_i}{r^2}\ell \\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell}\delta u\delta v + H_{mn}\frac{r_m e_n}{r}\ell, \end{cases}$$

$$H_{mn} = \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_m \partial x_k} \left[p\delta_{kn} - \tau_{kn}^{SGS} + 2\nu \tilde{S}_{kn}\right]\right)^{anisotropi}$$

For general *D*:

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left[\delta v^2 - \left(1 - \frac{2}{D}\right) \delta u^2 \right] - \dots Q^* + \dots$$

The higher *D*, the weaker the coupling with other directions, more tendency towards long tails from advected delta-vee system

Suzuki et al. (Phys. Fluids 17, 2005): DNS of 64^4 and 128^4 turbulence shows PDFs of δu in 4-D a bit more intermittent than in 3-D



Effects of pressure Hessian, SGS and viscous force gradients :

$$\begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \frac{1}{\ell} \left(\delta v^2 - \delta u^2\right) - \frac{2}{3}Q\ell + H_{mn}\frac{r_m r_i}{r^2}\ell \qquad H_{mn} = \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_m \partial x_k} \left[p\delta_{kn} - \tau_{kn}^{SGS} + 2v\tilde{S}_{kn}\right]\right)^{ansonope} \\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -\frac{1}{\ell}\delta u\delta v + H_{mn}\frac{r_m e_n}{r}\ell, \end{cases}$$

In equation for joint PDF of ($\delta u, \delta v$), terms enter as conditional averages:



$$\left(P(\delta u, \delta v)\left\langle\frac{r_m r_n}{r^2}\ell\frac{\partial^2 \tilde{p}}{\partial x_m \partial x_n}|\delta u, \delta v\right\rangle, P(\delta u, \delta v)\left\langle\frac{r_m e_n}{r}\ell\frac{\partial^2 \tilde{p}}{\partial x_m \partial x_n}|\delta u, \delta v\right\rangle\right)$$





Summary:

• We have found a higher-dimensional variant of the Burgers' 1-D gradient-steepening equation:

$$\frac{d}{dt}\delta u = -\delta u^2 \longrightarrow \begin{cases} \frac{d}{dt}\delta u = \delta v^2 - \delta u^2 \\ \frac{d}{dt}\delta v = -2\delta u \ \delta v \end{cases}$$
See:
Phy
16

See: Yi & Meneveau, Phys. Rev. Lett. **95**, 164502, Oct. 2005

- Describes simple "mechanism" of self and cross amplification of velocity increments, leading to skewness in longitudinal and flare-up of long tails in transverse velocity increments.
- Due to Lagrangian nature, a measure correction must be applied to evolving PDFs.
- Q- δu^2 correlation: Predicts correct trends as function of dimensionality.
- Quantitative predictions stationary PDFs as function of scale: need to take into account the effects of neglected terms. Analysis of DNS shows these effects are "non-trivial" (& each term different trends).